

**MINUTES OF THE GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE HELD ON  
FRIDAY 11 OCTOBER 2019 AT FRIENDS MEETING HOUSE, MANCHESTER**

**PRESENT:**

**Member**

Councillor Stuart Haslam  
Councillor Roy Walker  
Councillor Naeem Hassan  
Councillor Dzidra Noor  
Councillor Howard Sykes  
Councillor Sean Fielding  
Councillor Phil Burke  
Councillor Shah Wazir  
Councillor Roger Jones  
Councillor Barry Warner  
Councillor David Meller  
Councillor Angie Clark  
Councillor Warren Bray  
Councillor Peter Robinson  
Councillor Doreen Dickinson  
Councillor Nathan Evans  
Councillor Mark Aldred (Chair)  
Councillor Joanne Marshall

**Representing**

Bolton  
Bury  
Manchester  
Manchester  
Oldham  
Oldham  
Rochdale  
Rochdale  
Salford  
Salford  
Stockport  
Stockport  
Tameside  
Tameside  
Tameside  
Trafford  
Wigan  
Wigan

**Officers in attendance**

|                  |  |
|------------------|--|
| Bob Morris       | Chief Operating Officer                        |
| Simon Warbuton   | Director of Strategy                           |
| Alison Chew      | Interim Head of Bus Services                   |
| Alex Cropper     | Head of Operations                             |
| Danny Vaughan    | Head of Metrolink                              |
| Caroline Whittam | Head of Rail Franchising                       |
| Gwynne Williams  | Deputy Monitoring Officer, GMCA                |
| Nick Roberts     | Head of Services and Commercial<br>Development |
| Nicola Ward      | Governance and Scrutiny                        |
| Ninoshka Martin  | Governance and Scrutiny                        |

**Operators in attendance**

|             |                        |
|-------------|------------------------|
| Adam Clark  | Stagecoach             |
| Gareth Mead | Warrington's Own Buses |
| Guy Warren  | First Group            |

**GMTC 39/19 APOLOGIES**

**RESOLVED /-**

That apologies were received and noted from Councillors Angeliki Stogia, John Leech, Atteque Ur-Rehman and Liam O'Rourke.

**GMTC 40/19 CHAIRS ANNOUNCEMENTS AND URGENT BUSINESS**

**RESOLVED /-**

There were no chairs announcements or urgent business.

**GMTC 41/19 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

**RESOLVED /-**

Councillor Phil Burke declared a personal interest in relation to item 6 (Transport Network Performance) and item 7 (Metrolink Annual Performance Report) as an employee of Metrolink.

**GMTC 42/19 MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD 13 SEPTEMBER 2019**

**RESOLVED /-**

1. That the minutes of the GM Transport Committee held on 13 September 2019 be approved as a correct record subject the amendments as below.
  - GMTC/34/19 to read 'A member reported that a number of his constituents had been charged *in excess of what they had anticipated* for their Metrolink journey following the introduction of contactless payments *because they had failed to touch out.*'
  - GMTC/34/19 to read 'The Committee were informed that Metrolink Passengers who had not *touched* out and therefore charged for a day fare, could request a refund via TfGM.'
  - GMTC/34/19 resolution 5 to read 'That it be noted that Metrolink Passengers who have been charged *because they failed to touch out* using contactless payments can request a refund via TfGM.'
  - GMTC/34/19 resolution 6 to read 'That it be noted that a breakdown of reliability issues by Metrolink line be incorporated into the Metrolink *Annual Report.*'

- GMTC/36/19 to read 'Northern confirmed that this was primarily due to driver shortages
  - GMTC/36/19 to read 'A member raised concerns regarding the short notice cancellations, and non-stopping trains with no advance notice, which was affecting Rochdale *and Stockport* Stations (Smithy Hill, Castleton, Mills Hill *and Romiley*).
  - GMTC/36/19 resolution 7 to read 'That an analysis of 'penalty fares' issued since 2017 be incorporated into the next Rail Performance report, *subject to data availability*.'
2. That in relation to the Centre for Local Economic Strategies, that the request to review the role of public transport in reducing public health inequalities be agreed.
  3. That it be noted that the mid-tier submission would be submitted on the 18 October 2019, and therefore there was no further information for Members at this stage.

#### **GMTC 43/19 GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME**

Gwynne Williams, Deputy Monitoring Officer, GMCA introduced the latest version of the work programme for the Greater Manchester Transport Committee, which had incorporated potential future report items as suggested by members.

In addition, members suggested that consideration be given to the future report on Age Friendly Transport, and whether it could include a review of the concessionary pass for pensioners before 9.30am.

In relation to bus shelters, members sought clarity as to whether the remit of the new GM Transport Committee allowed for these to be considered in a formal committee setting, or whether another process would be more efficient in responding to Members regarding shelter requests within their Local Authority.

Members further requested bringing forward the climate change report in advance of March 2020 following the recent climate change emergency declaration by the GMCA.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the draft work programme from November 2019 to March 2020 be noted.
2. That it be agreed that the forthcoming report on Age Friendly Transport consider as to the potential extension of the operational time to use concessionary passes before 9.30 am for pensioners.
3. That it be agreed that TfGM provide a direct response to Councillor Sykes in relation to his local bus shelter enquiries.

4. That it be agreed that officers review the terms of reference of the new GM Transport Committee to clarify its role in relation to bus shelters with a view to determining a process for member engagement regarding shelters within their respective areas.
5. That it be agreed that officers consider the potential of bringing a future report to the Committee on the impact of public transport on climate change in advance of the current proposed timescale of March 2020.

#### **GMTC 44/19 TRANSPORT NETWORK PERFORMANCE**

Alex Cropper, Head of Operations, TfGM took members through a report which set out an overview of transport network performance in Greater Manchester for August 2019. He highlighted that heavy rain, issues with the Toddbrook Dam in Whaley Bridge and depot trespass issues had been detrimental to performance over this period. However, the school holiday period had also reduced journey times to result in overall good performance. The Our Pass scheme for 16-18 year olds had recently been successfully launched with a multi-agency approach and had been well received by young people.

Members questioned the current status of rail services in GM, and in particular the proposals for Sunday services which had been recommended by ASLEF (Associated Society of Locomotive Engineers & Firemen), but rejected by its members. Latest information from Northern had also indicated that the removal of the Pacer trains would be delayed, however members had been made aware that there was a commitment to ensure their removal by the end of 2019.

Members further reported a £25m deficit between Northern and Government, hence discussions regarding the future of the franchise were still ongoing. The GMCA had already urged for the termination of their franchise due to poor performance, and the Mayor had also committed to continue to lobby for improved rail services across GM.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the report be noted.
2. That it be agreed that TfGM share information directly with Councillor Adshead in relation to the increase in train delay minutes over the last period as reported by Network Rail.
3. That it be noted that members were advised to raise their concerns regarding the delayed removal of the Pacer trains directly with Northern and that it be noted that TfGM would continue to pursue Northern in response to their recent announcement regarding the delay in the removal of the Pacer trains.

## **GMTC 45/19 METROLINK ANNUAL PERFORMANCE REPORT**

Daniel Vaughan, Head of Metrolink, TfGM introduced a report which provided an overview of the operational performance of Metrolink services over the last year up until August 2019. He reported patronage growth, with circa 45m annual trips, positioning Metrolink patronage ahead of forecasted levels. However, with this demand, there had been some issues regarding capacity resulting in additional trams being allocated to the Bury, Oldham and Ashton lines. The introduction of the zonal fare structure and contactless payments had gone well, with predominately positive experiences expressed by passengers (90% customer satisfaction).

Across the year, Metrolink was performing well until July, when the summer months brought an increase in issues with rolling stock, and overhead lines. There were also an increase in road traffic accidents and some break-downs attributed to the hot weather.

However, as the Metrolink system matures, there had been less and less infrastructure issues and an overall reduction in anti-social behaviour. In relation to this, there were planned changes to the Travelsafe Partnership from November 2019, which would see more uniformed police on trams.

Through the service level agreement with the operator KAM (KEOLIS-Amey Metrolink), there had been 28 apprenticeships offered, and 48% of services to support the contract had been procured within a 25 mile radius of GM.

Transport Focus had nominated Metrolink for the light rail operator of the year award, which was a significant achievement against larger operators. Benchmarking internationally had also shown significant value for money in the Metrolink service.

Members questioned as to whether there were sidings available to place trams which had broken down to ensure the system could begin moving as quickly as possible. In particular, a member reported a breakdown on the Bury line which had resulted in bus alternatives and significant passenger confusion. Officers were aware of the failure of a double tram in a tunnel, that required concentration on the safety of passengers who were on board as priority. In such instances, contingency plans and the use of sidings were not always possible, hence some disruption to the wider network.

Members questioned whether there were any interim arrangements for increase police presence on trams before the changes to the Travel Safe Partnership had been implemented in November. Officers reported that the Partnership was aware of the impact of a slight delay to their previously published programme, and were in discussions with KAM to ensure that the balance of security/customer service staff was right now, and going forward into the future.

A member asked whether the additional 27 trams as detailed in the report were included with those to come into the network as part of the Trafford Park expansion. Officers

confirmed that these were additional units which would be used to increase double units on existing routes and increase capacity over the whole system.

Members asked for some feedback following the introduction of zonal fares, and it was reported that it had generally gone well and passengers feedback indicating that they feel travel is better value for money, with only some reported confusion in relation to the change in payment machine screens. There had also been some incidents of people being charged for a day ticket after failing to tap out, however refunds were available via TfGM for infrequent offences.

A member asked about the Operators commitment to the GMCA's Social Value Policy and it was confirmed that this is detailed within the contract as part of the procurement process.

A member also requested information in relation to Metrolink on a line-by-line basis. Officers confirmed that this was available on a monthly basis via the TfGM website, but could also be provided to members upon request.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the performance report be noted.
2. That it be noted that KAM (KEOLIS-Amey Metrolink) have indicated that they will attend future meetings of the GM Transport Committee in relation to any report on Metrolink.
3. That it be agreed that officers provide a summary breakdown of staff employed by KAM directly to Councillor Haslam.
4. That it be noted that detailed information on Metrolink issues was available on the TfGM website on a monthly basis, but can also be provided to members directly upon request.

#### **GMTC 46/19 FORTHCOMING CHANGES TO THE BUS NETWORK (Key Decision)**

Nick Roberts, Head of Services and Commercial Development, TfGM took members through a report which informed the Committee of the changes that have taken place to the bus network since the last meeting and any consequential action taken or proposed by Transport for Greater Manchester.

In relation to service 180, members had received representations from a resident opposed to the planned changes from First. Officers from TfGM offered to facilitate the opportunity for further dialogue in relation to the proposed changes to this service.

Members urged that in relation to any proposed changes, that these are shared with elected members as they can often suggest alternative solutions that would meet the needs of local residents.

Members welcomed the planned introduction of a 5 minute service by Go-North West from Manchester-Middleton, however had some concerns as to its reliability as per the previous 10 minute service. Furthermore, members welcomed the splitting of services at Oldham Town Centre to improve reliability, but urged operators to consider through fares as an option for passengers. Operators confirmed that passengers making these journeys tended to be users of a day/week ticket.

Members reported significant issues in relation to Diamond Buses, including a lack of drivers, a lack of frequency of services, buses without capacity and vandalism at their depot. They questioned whether Diamond had the ability to deliver the contract as members had received a number of complaints about their services.

Members welcomed the introduction of additional services Logistics North Bolton Link serving commuters to Logistics North, but noted that there had been a number of refusals due to capacity issues. It was questioned as to whether the increased service could be introduced earlier than January 2020. Officers agreed to look at this, but suspected that it was in relation to contract agreements.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the changes to the commercial network and the proposals not to replace the de-registered commercial services as set out in Annex A be noted.
2. That the changes to the commercial network and the proposals not to replace the de-registered commercial services as set out in Annex A, be agreed.
3. That it be noted that First will re-consider (following correspondence received from a local resident) the proposed commercial changes to service 180.
4. That the proposed action in respect of changes or de-registered commercial services as set out in Annex B be agreed.
5. That the proposed changes to general subsidised services set out in Annex C be approved.
6. That it be agreed that TfGM review whether the start date of changes to the Logistic North Local Link could be brought forward.

Bob Morris, Chief Operating Officer, TfGM introduced a report which informed members of the publication of the GM Prospectus for Rail, and linked strongly to the Strategic Rail Update report as introduced by Simon Warburton which provided an update on the work being undertaken by TfGM and partners on two long term strategic rail programme components: HS2 and Northern Powerhouse Rail and Tram-Train.

The Rail Prospectus was launched on the 26 September, covering four key aspects –

- Making best use of what's available now
- Delivering more capacity and better connectivity
- Devolved and accountable rail-based network
- Integrated travel between all modes.

The Prospectus would further be steered by the outcomes of the Williams review, and its findings in relation to the future of rail.

HS2 and Northern Powerhouse Rail were two critical elements to the rail prospectus, within a set of deliverables to address the current rail challenges. It was vital that the network is developed to support sector growth, and manage passenger demand. Transport for the North and the Department for Transport have already undertaken some work in relation to a growth strategy for rail stations and how they can contribute to the growth of the GM economy as a whole.

There is a national review of HS2 to which GM are contributing.

In relation to tram-train, there was a new momentum for taking this forward following the Prospectus, and a number of potential corridors had already been identified.

Members welcomed plans in relation to Stockport Train Station, as a key element of the Mayoral Development Area, there was already work underway to engage with Network Rail to deliver improvements in and around the station. However, there was also a programme of work required to fully understand the impact of HS2 on Stockport Station, and release further capacity for localised services.

A member of the committee urged that myths around the potential for surplus funding should HS2 be cancelled are challenged, as without the removal of fast trains from the network, capacity will not be able to be increased and therefore HS2 was a vital contributing factor to the successful development of the train network.

Members were concerned that there had been little progression in relation to tram-train, and only ever one trial in the UK. It was felt that there was little commitment from Government in relation to these concepts and potentially further expansion of the Metrolink system would be greater supported.

A Member asked about the potential for a train station in Diggle, as this was not included in the 2040 Delivery Plan. Officers confirmed that this Plan was still in draft form, and the



consultation responses were currently being reviewed. Final agreement on its content would be approved by the GMCA in due course.

A Member reported an exceptional station at Hindley, which had been improved by the Friends of Hindley Station group, and a range of activities undertaken with young people and other disadvantaged groups. The Station had also recently been awarded a Wigan in Bloom award.

Members were reminded of the Community Friends Day where all groups were invited to share good news and have a networking opportunity. There was a lot of activity like this across the network, and it was important to recognise all their efforts.

A member urged for consideration to be given to a station request for Cheadle, where the platform remains, and a potential to serve a number of large scale employers. Officers confirmed that Cheadle was on the map as a potential new station site, however there were some challenges as a result of a single track to and from the station.

In relation to a tram-train service to Marple, a member also urged that officers consider a rail route to Stockport. Officers confirmed that a rapid transit corridor between Marple and Stockport had been considered, however it was proving a challenging business case to address as the end point was not of a significant scale.

The Wigan-Manchester line passes at the base of Logistics North, which would prove an ideal location for a station to service the businesses. Members added that Bolton to Walkden railway line could also be used to link to Bolton Hospital. Officers agreed to consider the opportunity provided through the Bolton-Walkden line.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the reports be noted.
2. That it be noted that the Delivery Plan was currently in draft form, and following the review of the consultation responses, would be submitted to the GMCA for approval.
3. That the Committee record its thanks to all Friends of Station Groups, with special mention to the Friends of Hindley Station who had recently received a national award for their work with young people and disadvantaged groups, in addition to a local award from Wigan in Bloom.
4. That it be agreed that TfGM respond directly to Councillor Stuart Haslam in relation to proposals relating to links to Bolton Hospital.

#### **GMTC 48/19 EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC**

#### **RESOLVED /-**

That, under section 100 (A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972 the press and public should be excluded from the meeting for the following items of business on the grounds that this involved the likely disclosure of exempt information, as set out in the relevant paragraphs of Part 1, Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 and that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information.

**GMTC 49/19 FORTHCOMING CHANGES TO THE BUS NETWORK - PART B**

**RESOLVED /-**

That the report be noted.